

Meeting	Corporate and Scrutiny Management Policy and Scrutiny Committee (Calling In)
Date	3 January 2017
Present	Councillors Williams (Chair), Galvin (Vice-Chair), Brooks (Substitute for Councillor Lisle), Crisp, D'Agorne, Fenton, Gates, Levene and Reid
Apologies	Councillor Lisle

---

#### **11. Declarations of Interest**

Members were asked to declare any personal interests not included on the Register of Interests, any prejudicial interests or any disclosable pecuniary interests which they might have in respect of business on the agenda.

Councillors Crisp and Reid both declared a personal interest as they had recently received their free bus passes.

#### **12. Public Participation**

It was reported that there had been one registration to speak at the meeting under the Council's Public Participation Scheme on the following item.

##### **3. Called-in Item: Park and Ride Service Operator Specification**

Mr Dave Merrett spoke on the importance of the Park and Ride service to the City of York. He expressed his concerns around the air quality in the city, and the public health impact this had. He hoped that the Committee would recommend that Option 2 be amended to require all six routes to be Ultra Low Emission Vehicle (ULEV) based.

#### **13. Called-In Item: Park and Ride Service Operator Specification**

Members received a report which set out the reasons for the call-in and the role of the Committee, together with options

available to it under the agreed pre-decision call-in arrangements.

In accordance with those arrangements, three Members (Councillors Craghill, D'Agorne and Kramm) had called in the above item from the Forward Plan for the following reasons:

- The recommended Option 2 would undermine Executive commitment made in Dec 2015 in Air Quality Action Plan 3 for the most frequent bus services in the city centre 'to be required to have zero emission capability by 2018' \* Local Air Quality Management (LAQM) Annual Status Report 2016.
- By not requiring rapid transition from two routes to fully ultra-low-emission vehicle (ULEV) status on all routes within the first half of the contract, CYC would undermine its 2012 Low Emission Strategy, in particular the proposed Clean Air Zone due to be introduced by 2018 in order to achieve compliance with the health based objectives for air quality. This was explicitly called for in representations to the Executive but ignored in their decision to move ahead on Option 2.
- Recent draft guidance from NICE (National Institute for Clinical Excellence) to local councils making specific proposals about designating Clean Air Zones had not been considered in this decision. The Executive had a statutory public health responsibility to 'improve the health of the local population'. Given that between 94 and 163 premature deaths in York were attributed to the effects of air pollution, the Executive should have ensured that the proposal was compliant with its approved Low Emission Strategy and draft Clean Air Zone to bring air pollution down to within safe limits.

Councillor Kramm spoke on behalf of the calling-in Members explaining their concerns in relation to Air Quality and the 2012 Low Emission Strategy. He stressed the importance of achieving a timescale for 100% ULEV operation and requested that the Committee refer this issue back to the Executive.

The Executive Member for Transport and Planning spoke in response to the points made by call-in Members. He stated that, whilst the Council were committed to improving air quality, the

decision made by the Executive was the right one to ensure the continued operation of the Park and Ride service.

Officers were then invited to address the Committee and responded to various questions. They clarified that the chosen option would not preclude a move to Ultra Low Emission Vehicles, but they had left this in the hands of operators, as too many restrictions could again leave the Council in a position with no compliant bids. They confirmed that the most viable options had been presented to the Executive to ensure that there was no reduction in service. They highlighted that York's sightseeing buses would be converting to electric vehicles and this would take the total number of ULEVs in the city to 18.

Members then debated the 'call-in' fully and considered the options outlined in the report, namely whether to make any formal comments to the Executive or not.

It was agreed by the Committee to request that the Executive Member for Transport and Planning attend an appropriate future meeting with a report as to how he would encourage bus operators to adopt ULEV standards over the course of the contract.

Councillor D'Agorne moved Option B, to make specific recommendations to the Executive on the report, Councillor Levene seconded. On being put to the vote this motion fell.

Resolved: That, in accordance with Option A, there are no grounds to make specific recommendations to the Executive in respect of the report. The original decision taken on the item by the Executive on 7 December 2016 will be confirmed and will take effect from the date of the CSMPSC (Calling-In) meeting.

Reason: To enable the called-in matter to be dealt with efficiently and in accordance with the requirements of the Council's Constitution.

Cllr D Williams, Chair

[The meeting started at 5.30 pm and finished at 7.00 pm].